5th Asian-Pacific Summer School on Formal Methods

姜清

國

August 5-10, 2013, Tsinghua University, Beijing, China

# Program Verification in Coq

Guillaume Melquiond August 9th, 2013



http://sts.thss.tsinghua.edu.cn/Coqschool2013



# Cheat Sheet (1/4)

Things that are always good to do:

- When an assumption states x <> x, change the goal to False using exfalso, then conclude.
- When two assumptions are in contradiction, change the goal to False using exfalso, then conclude.
- When an assumption states C1 ... = C2 ... with C1 and C2 two different constructors, discriminate it.

< □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > <

- ▶ When the goal is an equality x = x, use reflexivity.
- ▶ When the goal is True, apply I.

# Cheat Sheet (2/4)

Things that are (almost) always good to do:

- When the goal is a forall, an implication, a negation, introduce its left-hand side with intros.
- When an assumption is a conjunction or an inductive object with a single constructor (e.g. a pair), destruct it.
- When the goal is a disjunction, select the provable side using left and right as soon as you know it.
- Perform computations with simpl, or with change if simpl goes too far.

Things that are good to do, but as late as possible:

- When the goal is a conjunction, split it.
- When an assumption is a disjunction or an inductive object with several constructors, destruct it.

◆□▶ ◆□▶ ◆三▶ ◆三▶ 三三 のへぐ

Things to do in the remaining cases:

- When the goal contains an application f x with f a fixpoint definition, perform an induction on x.
- Before doing the induction, revert all the arguments that are not constant in the recursive call of f.

< □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > <

- ▶ When the goal contains a match on a value, destruct it.
- Do apply lemmas or rewrite with equalities.

### Some Simple Functions on Lists

```
Definition head {T : Type} (l : list T) : option T :=
  match l with
  | nil => None
  | cons h _ => Some h
  end.
Definition tail {T : Type} (l : list T) : list T :=
  match l with
  | nil => nil
  | cons h q => q
  end.
```

◆□ > ◆□ > ◆ □ > ◆ □ > → □ = → ○ < ⊙

### Accessing the *n*-th Element of a List

◆□▶ ◆□▶ ◆臣▶ ◆臣▶ 臣 の�?

## Modifying the *n*-th Element of a List

▲□▶ ▲□▶ ▲□▶ ▲□▶ □ のQ@

Note: the original list is not modified; a new list is returned.

## Time Complexity for Standard Lists

Time complexity: how many lists have to be constructed / destructed in order to perform a given operation.

► cons:	T -> list T -> list T	O(1)
► head:	list T -> option T	O(1)
▶ tail:	list T -> list T	O(1)
▶ get :	list T -> nat -> option T	O(n)
▶ set :	list T -> nat -> T -> list T	O(n)

◆□▶ ◆□▶ ◆三▶ ◆三▶ 三三 のへぐ

Note: get and set are slow!

### Random Access Lists (Chris Okasaki)

Time complexity: how many lists have to be constructed / destructed in order to perform a given operation.

▶ ra	cons:	T -> ralist -> ralist	O(1)
▶ ra	head:	ralist -> option T	O(1)
▶ ra	tail:	ralist -> ralist	O(1)
▶ ra	.get :	ralist -> nat -> option T	$O(\log n)$
▶ ra	set :	ralist -> nat -> T -> ralist	$O(\log n)$

< □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > <

Note: get and set went from O(n) to  $O(\log n)$ .

## Random Access Lists (Chris Okasaki)

Internal representation:

- ► List of balanced trees with nodes labeled by elements of T.
- Trees of the list have strictly increasing heights. Exception: the first two trees may have the same height.
- The older the elements, the further in the list of trees they are. Tree elements are stored with a depth-first pre-order traversal.



Note: the reduced complexity comes from the fact that 2n operations suffices to access the  $2^n$  first elements.

### Adding an Element to a RA List

If the first two trees have different heights,



If the first two trees have the same height,



ヘロン 人間と ヘヨン ヘヨン

э

## Coq Types for Representing RA Lists

```
Variable T : Type.
Inductive tree :=
  | Leaf : T -> tree
  | Node : T -> tree -> tree -> tree.
Inductive ralist :=
  | raNil : ralist
  | raCons : tree -> nat -> ralist -> ralist.
```

Note: raCons stores a tree, its height, and the remaining of the list.

### Definition of Head

◆□▶ ◆□▶ ◆臣▶ ◆臣▶ 三臣 - のへで

In order to verify that rahead is correct, one has to prove that it has the same behavior as head.

< □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > <

```
Definition abs : ralist -> list T := ...
Lemma rahead_correct :
  forall l : ralist,
  rahead l = head (abs l).
```

Abstracting from RA Lists to Standard Lists

```
Fixpoint abs_tree (t : tree) {struct t} : list T :=
match t with
  | Leaf x => cons x nil
  | Node x t1 t2 =>
    cons x (app (abs_tree t1) (abs_tree t2))
end.

Fixpoint abs (1 : ralist) {struct 1} : list T :=
match 1 with
  | raNil => nil
  | raCons t _ q => app (abs_tree t) (abs q)
end.
```

◆□▶ ◆□▶ ◆三▶ ◆三▶ 三三 - のへぐ

### Definition and Correctness of Cons

```
Definition racons (x : T) (l : ralist) : ralist :=
  match l with
  | raNil => raCons (Leaf x) 0 l
  | raCons t s raNil => raCons (Leaf x) 0 l
  | raCons t1 h1 (raCons t2 h2 q) =>
    if h1 == h2 then raCons (Node x t1 t2) (1 + h1) q
    else raCons (Leaf x) 0 l
end.
```

```
Lemma racons_correct :
   forall (x : T) (l : ralist),
   abs (racons x l) = cons x (abs l).
```

### Definition and Correctness of Tail

```
Definition ratail (1 : ralist) : ralist :=
  match 1 with
  | raNil => raNil
  | raCons t h q =>
   match t with
    | Leaf _ => q
    | Node t1 t2 =>
      raCons t1 (h - 1) (raCons t2 (h - 1) q)
   end
  end.
Lemma ratail_correct :
 forall l : ralist,
  abs (ratail 1) = tail (abs 1).
```

▲□▶ ▲□▶ ▲□▶ ▲□▶ □ のQ@

# Summary

What was done:

- Defining tree and list.
- Defining rahead, racons, and ratail.
- Proving that they behave like head, cons, and tail, according to the abs mapping.

What has not be done yet:

Proving that racons and ratail produce trees that are both balanced and of (strictly) increasing height.

- Defining raget and raset.
- Proving that they are correct.

#### Data Invariant

```
Fixpoint height (t : tree) {struct t} : nat :=
match t with
  | Leaf _ => 0
  | Node _ t1 _ => 1 + height t1
end.

Fixpoint balanced (t : tree) {struct t} : Prop :=
match t with
  | Leaf _ => True
  | Node _ t1 t2 =>
    height t1 = height t2 /\
    balanced t1 /\ balanced t2
end.
```

▲ロト ▲帰 ト ▲ ヨ ト ▲ ヨ ト ・ ヨ ・ の Q ()

Note: height assumes that the tree is balanced.

### Data Invariant

```
Fixpoint structured_aux (l : ralist) (h : nat)
        {struct l} : Prop :=
  match 1 with
  | raNil => True
  | raCons t h' q =>
    balanced t /\ height t = h' /\ h <= h' /\
    structured_aux q (1 + h')
  end.
Definition structured (1 : ralist) : Prop :=
  match 1 with
  | raNil => True
  | raCons t h q =>
    balanced t /\ height t = h /\
    structured_aux q h
  end.
```

Note: these are functional predicates, rather than inductive ones.

### Preservation of Invariant

```
Lemma structured_racons :
  forall (l : ralist) (x : T),
  structured l ->
  structured (racons x l).
Lemma structured_ratail :
  forall (l : ralist),
  structured l ->
```

▲□▶ ▲□▶ ▲□▶ ▲□▶ □ のQ@

structured (ratail 1).

### Definition of Get

```
Fixpoint tree_get (t : tree) (h : nat) (n : nat)
         {struct t} : option T :=
  match t with
  | Leaf x => if n == 0 then Some x else None
  | Node x t1 t2 =>
   if n == 0 then Some x
   else
      let s := height2size (h - 1) in
      if n \le s then tree_get t1 (h - 1) (n - 1)
     else tree_get t2 (h - 1) (n - 1 - s)
  end.
Fixpoint raget (l : ralist) (n : nat)
         {struct l} : option T :=
  match 1 with
  | raNil => None
  | raCons t h q =>
   let s := height2size h in
   if n < s then tree_get t h n
   else raget q (n - s)
  end.
```

▲ロト ▲冊 ▶ ▲ ヨ ▶ ▲ ヨ ▶ ● の Q @

Principles:

- 1. Write a library in Coq.
- 2. Prove its correctness using Coq.
- 3. Extract it to a functional language, e.g. OCaml or Haskell.

▲□▶ ▲圖▶ ★ 国▶ ★ 国▶ - 国 - のへで

4. Profit!

### Code Extraction

Map Coq types to types from the target language:

```
Extract Inductive bool =>
  "bool" [ "true" "false" ].
Extract Inductive option =>
  "option" [ "Some" "None" ].
Extract Inductive nat => "int" [ "0" "succ" ]
  "(fun f0 fS n ->
        if n=0 then f0 () else fS (n-1))".
```

Note: the mapping of nat is unsafe.

Map Coq functions:

```
Extract Inlined Constant leb => "(<=)".
Extract Inlined Constant eqb => "(==)".
Extract Inlined Constant plus => "(+)".
Extract Inlined Constant minus => "(-)".
```

Note: the mapping of minus is terribly wrong.